## OF COURSE NO REFERENCE BOOK WOULD BE COMPLETE WITHOUT HISTORICAL AND CURRENT INFORMATION ON FRAUD, AUTHENTICATION AND MORE:

# RECONDITIONED, ADULTERATED, FRAUDULENT OR GENUINE?

The official history of Burgundy features monks searching for messages from God, the Hospices de Beaune auction, the Paulée de Meursault and landowners fiercely defending the boundaries and ancient lineage of their *dimats* even in times of adversity, both natural and man-made. Unfortunately, no history of Burgundy would be complete without a discussion of fraud.

It may be useful to begin by defining some terms, as not all manipulations or even adulterations are fraudulent. Moreover certain types or levels of intervention may be anathema to some producers or consumers but accepted by others.

At the most basic level, certain additions have become commonplace and (up to a point) legal, the most well-known being the addition of sugar to increase the alcohol level, a practice known as chaptalization. Others that may be permissible include adding acid (acidification) or the addition of a small percentage of wine from a different vintage (up to 15% is legal in Burgundy). Because Burgundy's marginal climate has produced so many underripe vintages, producers have often used these techniques to create what they believe to be a better product.

These practices can easily slide over the line. Historically the addition of a small percentage of wine from a different vintage was not uncommon and may perhaps have been defensible when it involved, for example, making a lean and acidic wine more palatable (such as by adding some of the richly

fruity

Caveat Emptor

1959 Musigny, Georges Roumier

**Doug:** This was one of Rudy Kurniawan's favorite wines to counterfeit, along with the Roumier Bonnes Mares. Given that Roumier's total production of Musigny was probably about 400 bottles, of which half was sold at the time to a *négociant*—leaving around 200 made under the Roumier label—it is rather absurd that no fewer than 21 alleged bottles made their way to auction at Acker Merrall in 2006 and 2008 under Rudy's direct aegis (and who knows how many others he manufactured and sold at other auctions or privately). I have tasted four bottles sourced from these auctions, including one at the January 2007 authentication tasting; almost needless to say, none tasted remotely authentic.

inevitably deteriorate). If older stocks are released for sale, they often receive the domaine or maison label currently in use rather than the version in use at the time the vintage was first released. To those not familiar with the practice, it can be yet another point of confusion.

Managing director Frédéric Drouhin of Maison Joseph Drouhin relates the story of a Japanese customer who wrote to question the legitimacy of a Beaune Clos des Mouches label that had only five flies on it rather than the typical six. Drouhin called the printer's office and learned that employees there had noticed that the printing plates were becoming worn and should be replaced. The printing house's designer



Older bottles stored in an ancient cellar without labels or capsules.

thought that five flies looked better on the new plates than six, but no one bothered to tell the maison about the change. This is but one example of how questions of authenticity can be raised by printers' errors entering the stream of commerce initially unnoticed even by the producers.

Additionally, branding corks with the wine and vintage was not common practice in Burgundy. Also, many producers printed the vintage only on separate strips, not the

### DETAILED FIRST IMPRESSIONS ARE PROVIDED ON THE MOST RECENT VINTAGES AS WELL AS SCATTERED MEMORABLE MOMENTS AND WINES OF A LIFETIME VIGNETTES:

#### FIRST IMPRESSIONS

It is still too early to draw firm conclusions regarding the 2012 reds, and because the vintage is so heterogeneous, it is not susceptible to easy categorization.

.....



The Château de Gevrey-Chambertin and its vineyards. Its sale in 2012 to an Asian investor caused controversy in Burgundy.

Nonetheless we can offer some preliminary observations. Overall, the 2012 vintage produced highly variable reds whose quality ranged from excellent to awful. Still, the successful 2012 reds can be superb, with ripe fruit and succulent mid-palates, possessing abundant levels of dry extract supported by firm but mature tannins and balanced acidities. Potentially great wines were made by producers such as DRC, Rousseau, Jacques-Frédéric Mugnier, Ponsot and Georges Mugneret-Gibourg, among others; no less a superstar than Christophe Roumier believes he crafted some of the finest wines of his career in 2012. Most of the better 2012s will need 15 to 20.

#### MEMORABLE MOMENTS

1904 Style. Indeed the 1904s have kept well — 100 years after the vintage, Drouhin's Clos de Vougeot was a revelation. The tasting note herein does not do justice to the circumstances. The bottle was opened at a dinner at the home of Véronique Drouhin (of Maison Joseph Drouhin) and her husband Michel Boss. There were 18 people present and when the wine was served, as if by magic, all went silent. It is both rare and heartening to see such a large group collectively brought up short by the magnificence of the ancient wine in their glasses. At the urging of Michael Rockefeller, Véronique and Michel woke their three sleeping children to put a little of this century-old wine on their lips, a souvenir of their great-great-grandfather.

#### 1904 Clos de Vougeot, Joseph Drouhin

Tasted November 2004 from a bottle with -7.5 cm of ullage that was completely original.

BURGHOUND: Bricked through. This was an ethereal wine of incredible complexity and while there was certainly some sous-bois in evidence, it did not dominate. Rich, sweet and vibrant medium-full flavors offer superb depth and that mouth-coating, sweet and wonderfully persistent quality that defines old Burgundy at its finest. A magnificent wine of indescribable beauty. Score: 99

DB: Amazing sweet fruit on the nose, along with hints of lavender and plum. On the palate, there was more sweet fruit, a touch of earthiness, a hint of citrus and still good acidity, but above all, this was an incredibly harmonious, elegant wine with a velvet touch and almost endless length. Score: I am more promiscuous with perfect scores than Allen, and this deserved one — 100

#### WINES OF A LIFETIME

**Allen:** In November 2003, following the hottest summer and earliest harvest in more than a century, Bouchard Père & Fils invited a group of journalists and others to taste wines made in similarly dry and particularly hot years. While I can't say that they persuaded me that the 2003s would in time become great wines (see our evaluation of that vintage), it did provide an opportunity to taste an extraordinary wine, one of the best of my lifetime.

#### 1906 Romanée St.-Vivant, Bouchard Père & Fils

BURGHOUND: Tasted November 2003. Some bricking but with a ruby center. This possesses one of the most captivatingly elegant, pure, spicy and refined noses that I have ever encountered and it's frankly a fool's errand to even begin to attempt to describe the sheer breadth of aromatic expression. The medium-weight flavors

are still vibrant, precise and textured with fantastic breed. There is still some tannin lurking beneath the velvet, but as with the very best *grands crus*, they are refined and integrated. In sum, this is a perfectly balanced wine of supreme elegance and one of the greatest Burgundies of my experience. Score: 99

#### BURGUNDY VINTAGES FEATURES OVER 100 GRAPHICS AND COLOR PHOTOGRAPHS:



#### DUTY PAID LIST OF

### BOUCHARD PÈRE ET FILS' BURGUNDIES.

Bottled by W. J. & T. WELCH

(AGENTS),

IN CORN EXCHANGE VAULTS,

SEETHING LANE, GREAT TOWER STREET, LONDON. F.C.

	R	ED.		
	Måcon	@ 155, 17	State of the State	
		@ 174. 204. 21		
	Pommard		@ 281, 3	
	Neits	@ 28	@ 28s. 3 s. 32s. 30	
		e in Half-Bottles also.)	. 3.1. 3	
VINTAGE.	Per Don. Per Boules. a Don.	VINTAGE.	Per I	
SSS Pemmard	g-pots.	1881 Volnay	@ 541	
SSS Volnay			0 34	
889 Volnay		1890 Chambertin	,, 541	
888 Pommard		1881 Corton	, 541	
889 Pommard		1888 Chambertin	-	
886 Pemmard 889 Volnay		1887 Beaune Grève		
SSS Volnay		1887 Clos de la Me		
SS7 Volnay		1887 Chambertin	,, 601	
886 Volnay .	.0	1888 Chambertin (Clos de Bi	,, 66s	
886 Volnay .	. ,, 48s soft, fruity, nice wine.	1887 Santenot	661	
\$\$7 Volnay		100 m to 100 m		
887 Corton		1887 Chambertin 1886 Chambertin	,, 66s	
SS: Corton .	. ,, 50s — mature, fair body, 10 years in bottle.	1885 Chambertin	, 001	
886 Volnay .		1003 Cummocrem	11 /-	
S78 Volnay .		1877 Richebourg	,, 841	
	orges 52s 56s. good body.	1874 Corton	,, 86	
SS6 Corton		1		
	HERMITAGE, Red	3	%, per doser	
	WH	ITE.		
	Per Duz, Bottles.			
hablis	@ 201 245 281 301 361	Meursault		
ouilly .	@ 28s. 36s.	Chevalier Montrach	et	
	SPAR	KLING.		
			er Doe, Bottl	
	White	6		
	William Company and the same	man and the	475	

		П	
192	2 3	П	
	Grand Echézeaux	R	25
	Pommard Rugiens	R	25
	Bonnes Mares (de Vogué)		30
	Clos des Réas		30
	Corton Charlemagne (Chapuis)	R	30
	Romanée Saint-Vivant	R	30
	Chambertin (Rebourseau)	R	30
	Grand Corton Bressandes (L. Latour)	R	30
	Clos Vougeot (Rebourseau)		30
	La Tache (Liger Bélair)	R	40
	Clos Vougeot Grand Vin (Liger Bélair)	R	40
	Grand Richebourg (Liger Bélair)	R	40
	Malconsorts (Duvault-Blochet)	R	40
	Grand Corton Les Chaumes (Chapuis)	R	40
	Chambertin (Rousseau)	R	40
	Vosne Romanée (Duvault Blochet)	R	50
	Romanée Saint-Vivant (L. Latour)	R	50
192	2	Ш	
	Corton Clos du Roi	R	30
	Romanée Saint-Vivant (Moillard-Grivot)		60

A portion of the listing of 1923s in the Nicolas catalog for 1936, showing the Vosne-Romanée (Duvault-Blochet) and the Liger-Belair La Tâche.

An advertisement for Bouchard wines, from the early 1890s. Note particularly the recurring descriptors: "round," "fruity," "soft" and "flavory."



As bottles rest in the cellars of Burgundy, a covering of mold often forms.



ALLEN AND DOUG BELIEVE THAT BEYOND OFFERING SENSORY PLEASURE, EVERY BOTTLE OF BURGUNDY HAS A STORY TO TELL, A NARRATIVE BASED ON THE COMPLEX INTERWEAVING OF TERROIR, VITICULTURE, WINEMAKING AND VINTAGE. PLEASE JOIN THEM ON THIS 170-YEAR-LONG VINOUS JOURNEY THROUGH THE HISTORY OF BURGUNDY.



